

PH1513 Knowledge and Mind

Course Leaflet 2009-2010

Credits: 20

Please note carefully:

The full set of school regulations and procedures is contained in the Undergraduate Student Handbook which is available online at <http://www.abdn.ac.uk/sdhp/ugradstudenthandbook/>. Students are expected to familiarise themselves not only with the contents of this leaflet but also with the contents of the Handbook. Therefore, ignorance of the contents of the Handbook will not excuse the breach of any school regulation or procedure. You must familiarise yourself with this important information at the earliest opportunity.

COURSE CO-ORDINATORS

Dr Luca Moretti

Room OBG11, tel. 01224 272385, email: l.moretti@abdn.ac.uk

Dr Ulrich Stegmann,

Room OBG06, tel. 01224273679, email: u.stegmann@abdn.ac.uk

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This course gives an introduction to two closely connected core fields of Philosophy: the theory of knowledge and of mind. We will first address problems in the field of epistemology, which is concerned with what it is to know something. For example, how does knowledge differ from a lucky guess? What sorts of methods lead us to genuine knowledge rather than unreliable opinion? And, in an issue that has often been raised by philosophers, do we really know anything at all? There are initially plausible arguments that seem to show we can never know anything: examining what, if anything is wrong with these arguments will, hopefully, help us to see what knowledge really is and why it is important. We will also examine a number of issues in the philosophy of mind, especially the nature of the mind and its relations to the physical world. Is the mind separate from the physical world? Is it a non-physical soul that could survive bodily death? Or is the mind really nothing over and above the brain? Could things other than persons have minds?

TIMETABLE

Lectures: Two hours per week commencing in Week 1. Time and room: Tuesdays from 4 to 5pm in NK6 (New King's) **AND** Thursdays from 4 to 5pm in NK6 (New King's).

Tutorials: One hour per week commencing in Week 2. You **must** sign up for one of the tutorial groups before attending the first tutorial (i.e. during the course of Week 1), as there are limited numbers for each group – you do this using the webpage <http://www.abdn.ac.uk/MyCourses>.

COURSE STRUCTURE

The first twelve lectures and the accompanying six tutorials (remember: there is just one tutorial per week, but there are two lectures) will be devoted to epistemology, whereas the last twelve lectures and six tutorials will focus on the philosophy of mind.

LECTURES

The lectures are based on the following two textbooks, and we strongly recommend reading the chapters as indicated below:

- Duncan Pritchard, *What is this thing called Knowledge?* (Routledge, 2006).
- Ian Ravenscroft, *Philosophy of Mind: A Beginner's Guide* (OUP 2005).

Another recommended (though more advanced) textbook in epistemology is:

Jonathan Dancy, *Introduction to Contemporary Epistemology* (Blackwell, 1997).

An excellent anthology is Michael Huemer, *Epistemology; Contemporary Readings* (Routledge 2002). The anthology introduces and provides a brief commentary on some of the papers used in the tutorials.

Other recommended textbooks in philosophy of mind are:

John Heil, *Philosophy of Mind: A Contemporary Introduction*, (Routledge 2004) and

Jaegwon Kim, *Philosophy of Mind* (Westview Press 2005).

We placed copies of these books in the heavy demand-section of QML, but you might also consider buying your own copy (e.g. from the Blackwell's bookshop on campus).

Lecture 1: Introduction to epistemology

Pritchard, chapters 1 and 2.

"Epistemology" in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL:

<http://www.iep.utm.edu/epistemo/>].

Lecture 2: Definition of knowledge and the Gettier problem

Pritchard, chapter 3.

“Gettier Problems” in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://www.iep.utm.edu/gettier/>].

Dancy, chapter 2.

Lecture 3: Epistemic rationality and epistemic justification I

Pritchard, chapters 5.

“Internalist vs. Externalist Conceptions of Epistemic Justification” in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justep-intext/>].

Lecture 4: Epistemic rationality and epistemic justification II

Pritchard, chapters 5.

“Internalist vs. Externalist Conceptions of Epistemic Justification” in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justep-intext/>].

Lecture 5: Structure of Justification. Foundationalism I

Pritchard, chapter 4.

“Foundationalist Theories of Epistemic Justification” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justep-foundational/>]

Dancy, chapter 4.

Lecture 6: Structure of Justification. Foundationalism II

Pritchard, chapter 4.

“Foundationalist Theories of Epistemic Justification” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justep-foundational/>]

Dancy, chapter 4.

Lecture 7: Structure of Justification. Coherentism I

Pritchard, chapter 4.

“Coherentist Theories of Epistemic Justification” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justep-coherence/>]

Dancy, chapters 8.

Lecture 8: Structure of Justification. Coherentism II

Pritchard, chapter 4.

“Coherentist Theories of Epistemic Justification” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justep-coherence/>]

Dancy, chapters 8.

Lecture 9: Externalism about Justification. Reliabilism I

Pritchard, chapter 6.

“Reliabilism” in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL:
<http://www.iep.utm.edu/reliabil/>]

Lecture 10: Externalism about Justification. Reliabilism II

Pritchard, chapter 6.

“Reliabilism” in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL:
<http://www.iep.utm.edu/reliabil/>]

Lecture 11: The Problem of Scepticism I

Pritchard, chapter 12.

“Skepticism” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL:
<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/skepticism/>]

Dancy, chapter 1.

Lecture 12: The Problem of Scepticism II and Review

Pritchard, chapter 12.

“Skepticism” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [URL:
<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/skepticism/>]

Dancy, chapter 1.

Lecture 13: Introduction to the Mind-Body Problem. Cartesian Dualism

Ravenscroft, chapter 1.

Heil, chapters 1-3.

Gary Hatfield, 2003: *Descartes and the Meditations*. Routledge. Chapter 8.

Margaret Wilson, 1998: “The epistemological argument for mind-body distinctness”,
in Cottingham (ed.) *Descartes*. OUP, pp 186-196.

Lecture 14: Behaviourism

Ravenscroft, chapter 2.

Heil, chapter 5.

Kim, chapter 2.

Lecture 15: Identity Theory

Ravenscroft, chapter 3.

Heil, chapter 6.

Kim, chapter 3.

Lecture 16: Functionalism

Ravenscroft, chapter 4.

Heil, chapter 7.

Kim, chapters 4-5.

Lecture 17: The Representational Theory of Mind

Ravenscroft, chapter 6.

Heil, chapter 8.

Lecture 18: Connectionism

Ravenscroft, chapter 7.

Lecture 19: Eliminativism

Ravenscroft, chapter 5.

Heil, chapter 12.

Lecture 20: Supervenience

Ravenscroft, chapter 8.

Kim, chapter 9.

Lecture 21: Mental Content

Ravenscroft, chapter 9.

Kim, chapter 8.

Lecture 22: Mental Causation

Ravenscroft, chapter 10.

Heil, chapter 13.

Lecture 23: Consciousness and Physicalism

Ravenscroft, chapters 11-12, especially §§ 12.1-12.2

Tim Crane 2001: *Elements of Mind – An Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind*,
Oxford: OUP. Chapter 3.

Lecture 24: Review

TUTORIALS

There is a course reader for the tutorials which will be for sale from the departmental office. *Purchase of this coursepack is essential*, as it contains ALL the readings.

All readings for the tutorials are **compulsory**.

Tutorial Week 2:

Gettier Edmund, "Is Justified True Belief Knowledge?" in *Analysis* 23(6): 121-123.

Tutorial Week 3:

Alston, William 2002, "Has Foundationalism Been Refuted?" in Michael Huemer (ed.), *Epistemology – Contemporary Readings*. Oxford: Routledge 2002. [First published in *Philosophical Studies* 29 (1976): 287-305].

Tutorial Week 4:

BonJour, Laurence, 2002, "The Structure of Empirical Knowledge" in Michael Huemer (ed.), *Epistemology – Contemporary Readings*. Oxford: Routledge 2002. [First published as a chapter of BonJour, Laurence, *The Structure of Empirical Knowledge*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press 1985].

Tutorial Week 5:

Pollock, L. John, 1984, "Reliability and Justified Belief", *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 14(1): 104-114.

Tutorial Week 6:

René Descartes, *Meditations on First Philosophy*. Synopsis of the following six Meditations, Meditation I, Meditation II. [*Meditations, Objections, and Replies*, edited and translated by R. Ariew and D. Cress; Indianapolis: Hackett 2006].

Tutorial Week 7:

René Descartes, *Meditations on First Philosophy*. Meditation VI. [*Meditations, Objections, and Replies*, edited and translated by R. Ariew and D. Cress; Indianapolis: Hackett 2006.]

Tutorial Week 8:

J. J. C. Smart, 1959: "Sensation and Brain Processes", *Philosophical Review* 68: 141-156.

Tutorial Week 9:

Jerry Fodor 1987: *Psychosemantics – The Problem of Meaning in the Philosophy of Mind*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, Chapter 1.

Tutorial Week 10:

Paul Churchland 1981: "Eliminative Materialism and the Propositional Attitudes", *Journal of Philosophy* 78: 67-90.

Tutorial Week 11:

Hilary Putnam, 1973: "Meaning and Reference". *Journal of Philosophy* 70: 699-711. [Reprinted in A. W. Moore (ed.) *Meaning and Reference*, Oxford OUP 150-161.]

Tutorial Week 12:

Frank Jackson, 1986: "What Mary didn't Know", *Journal of Philosophy*, 83: 291-295

ESSAY SUBMISSION

Due Date: **19th April, 2010**

Word limit: 1500 words. Essays should be professionally formatted and spellchecked, presented in 12 point font with line spacing of at least 1½. The word limit is confined to plus or minus 10% and essays deviating in length from the norm will be subject to penalty. You will need to write the word count on the top left corner of the essay.

One paper copy of your essay, with signed coversheet, should be submitted to KCG11c by the due date. The other must be submitted to Turnitin (see appendix). Essays will not be accepted until you have submitted both copies.

Turnitin ID: 161064

Turnitin password (**case-sensitive**): PH1513

ESSAY TOPICS

Essay questions will be announced early in the course.

ASSESSMENT

1st Attempt: one 1,500 word essay (50%) and one two-hour written examination (50%).

Resit: one 1,500 word essay (50%) and one two-hour written examination (50%). Original essay mark carried forward if CAS 6 or above. New essay to be submitted if original essay CAS 5 or below.

AIMS

- Examination of key concepts and arguments in philosophical debates concerning the nature of the mind and the nature of knowledge.
- Exploration of some traditional problems of philosophy of mind and epistemology
- Increased familiarity and competence with rational argument as regards a range of philosophical problems and themes

OUTCOMES

A. Knowledge and Understanding of:

- Traditional theories of mind and knowledge

- Philosophical approaches to contemporary questions regarding the nature of knowledge and mind.

B. Intellectual skills – be able to:

- Articulate in philosophical argument
- Develop clarity and rigour of thought and expression in oral and written form
- Gain understanding of, and offer exposition and criticism of, issues and arguments presented by others
- Use technical philosophical terminology accurately

C. Practical skills – be able to:

- Engage in disciplined discussion with others
- Marshall complex information
- Engage in autonomous and self-motivated learning
- Think creatively, self-critically and independently
- Use the library and relevant C&IT software/hardware

D. Transferable skills – be able to:

- Identify and understand philosophical issues and arguments
- Articulate and develop arguments
- Engage in respectful participation in group discussion
- Offer critical expositions of positions proposed by others
- Acquire the discipline of learning
- Write logically structured, reasoned essays

PLAGIARISM

'Plagiarism is the use, without adequate acknowledgement, of the intellectual work of another person in work submitted for assessment. A student cannot be found to have committed plagiarism where it can be shown that the student has taken all reasonable care to avoid representing the work of others as his/her own.' Plagiarism is a serious offence everywhere, both within and outwith the academic community. All cases of suspected plagiarism will be reported to the Head of School in the first instance and cannot be discussed with or determined by a Tutor or Course Co-ordinator. Please note that students MUST refer to the School's Undergraduate Student Handbook for more detailed information on what constitutes plagiarism, how to avoid it, and what the University's procedure is should plagiarism be suspected.

Appendix - TurnitinUK

Information for Students

What is Turnitin® UK (A JISC Service)?

The service helps academic staff address a number of common but difficult to identify issues related to citation and collaboration in coursework assessments. It enables tutors to identify the original source of material included within student work by searching a database of several billion pages of reference material gathered from professional publications, student essay websites and other student works. It is used by academics as a tool to help them provide better information and feedback to students about the work they have submitted. The tool does not make decisions about the intention of unoriginal work, nor does it determine if unoriginal content is incorrectly cited or indeed plagiarised. It simply highlights sections of text that have been found in other sources to help academic staff members make these decisions. In many cases this will lead the academic member of staff to provide feedback to students on how to improve their coursework submissions and citations. All assessment decisions will continue to be made by the course tutor who will review the entire work.

What is the benefit of using the service?

Your institution wishes to encourage students to behave with honesty and integrity at all times. The correct citation of work and the authenticity of submitted work is a cornerstone, not just of our education system, but of the trust and value held in each of our education institutions by employers and the public at large. The use of this service along with other methods of maintaining the integrity of the academic process will help your institution maintain academic standards and assessment fairness.

How will my data be used?

In order for this service to work you will be required to submit your assignments to the service where they will be stored together with your name, email address, course details and institution. You may also opt to enter your address and phone number but this is *not* compulsory. Once your material has been uploaded it will be stored electronically in a database and compared against work submitted from this or any other department(s) within this institution or from other UK institutions using the service.

Your tutor will receive an Originality Report from the service. In most cases this feedback will be used by the tutor to instruct you about the process of citation and the importance of maintaining academic standards. In some cases, dependent on extent, level and context, the institution *may* decide to undertake further investigation which

could ultimately lead to disciplinary actions, should instances of plagiarism be detected. Such decisions are entirely at the discretion of your institution and in no way involve HEFCE (the Higher Education Funding Council for England) nor the service. In this circumstance it is possible that your personal data may need to be disclosed to academic staff within the other institution(s) from where matching content has been submitted.

HEFCE has overall responsibility for the processing of personal data carried out by Turnitin® UK (A JISC Service). HEFCE and each institution signing up to use the service will together act as Joint Data Controllers for the personal data submitted with students' work.

In order for your institution to make use of the service it will be necessary for personal data relating to you to be transferred to countries not governed by EU Data Protection legislation. However, it should be noted that *iParadigms*, the company processing your data are bound by terms of contract to at all times abide by the Data Protection Act 1998.

How long will the service keep my work?

The service will seek to retain content submitted to it and associated personal data until the termination of this service or its successor, thus helping to accumulate as large a corpus of knowledge as possible against which to compare submitted content.

Who owns the copyright to the work I have submitted?

HEFCE has no interest in acquiring the intellectual property rights for the content submitted by you. The copyright for such content will continue to reside with either yourself or your institution; whichever is currently the case.

The service will help to protect your work from future plagiarism and thereby help maintain the integrity of any qualification you receive.

What are my rights under the Data Protection Act?

As the data subject you do have the right to see what personal information is held about you in relation to this or any other service that stores your personal information and have limited rights to object to your data being used. Please refer to the Plagiarism Advisory Service web site (www.jiscpas.ac.uk) for further information regarding these rights.

If your personal data has been integrated into the service via your institution's student information system your request may require the institution to withdraw your

personal information from student information system as well. Your institution will be able to inform you of the implications of exercising this right under these conditions. Please note: your tutor can submit your work to the service without the use of personal data should you decide to exercise this right. The right to objection relates to the storage of your personal data and does not extend as a right to object to your tutor making use of technology aimed at improving academic standards when assessing your work

Student Instructions for TurnitinUK

TurnitinUK is an online service which compares student assignments with online sources including web pages, databases of reference material, and content previously submitted by other users across the UK.

The software makes no decision as to whether plagiarism has occurred; it is simply a tool which highlights sections of text that have been found in other sources. The assignment which has been submitted to TurnitinUK and an **Originality Report**¹ (the report which identifies the text matches found) are displayed for the member of staff to view. The member of staff can see whether resources have been appropriately referenced and hence whether plagiarism has occurred. *You will be able to view your own Originality Report **only** if the member of staff enables this.*

The following instructions will enable you to register to use Turnitin, enrol in a class and to submit an assignment. A comprehensive Student User Guide can be found at https://submit.ac.uk/usage_jisc/tiiuk_student_guide.pdf.

If you are a new user please begin at Step 1. If you have already used TurnitinUK, please go straight to Step 2.

Step 1: Create a User Profile

First, set up a unique user profile which consists of an email address, user password, personal user information and user preferences. *You will need a class id and enrolment password to enable you to create a user profile. If you do not have this information, please contact your tutor.*

- Go to http://submit.ac.uk/newuser_type.asp (Note: underscore _ between 'newuser' and 'type')

¹ For further information about the Originality Report see Section 2 of the Student User Guide https://submit.ac.uk/usage_jisc/tiiuk_student_guide.pdf.

- Follow the on-screen instructions to create your user profile. Use your University email address and choose your own password (*Note: choose one you will remember*)
- Click **end wizard and login**. This takes you to Step 4 on this sheet. The next time you log in to TurnitinUK start from Step 2.

Step 2: Login to TurnitinUK (once you have created a User Profile)

- Go to www.submit.ac.uk - click on **user login**
- At the login page enter email address (*your University of Aberdeen one as before*) and user password (*which you chose yourself at Step 1*)
- Click **login** to open your TurnitinUK homepage

Step 3: Enrol in a Class

Note: You will have enrolled in one class when you created your User Profile. When you need to enrol in another, follow these instructions:

- Starting from your TurnitinUK homepage, click **enrol in a class**
- Enter the **class id number** which you will be given by the relevant tutor
- Enter **enrolment password** – which again you will be given by the relevant tutor
- Click **submit** to enrol in a class and add it to your homepage

Step 4: Submit Coursework

- Click on the **class name** on your homepage
- Click the **submit button** next to assignment name in your class
- Select **file upload** from the pull-down menu entitled 'Submit a paper by' (at the top of the submission box)
- Enter the **submission title** (title of assignment)
- Click the **browse** button and locate the file for submission
- Click **submit** (top right-hand corner)
- Click **yes, submit** (*Note: you can only submit a piece of work once unless you are submitting a Revision Assignment – see below*)
- You will receive a **digital receipt** which will also be emailed to you

Revision Assignments

Your Tutor or Course Co-ordinator *may have made the Revision Assignment* facility available to you. If this is the case you will be allowed to submit a draft copy of your paper and have the opportunity to see your Originality Report and revise your work before submitting it for assessment. Your Course Co-ordinator or tutor has access to all Revision Assignments and can see how these have been changed or “fine-tuned” before submission. You need to submit your final paper to the main

assignment when you are satisfied with your work - it is *not automatically forwarded* from the Revision Assignment to the actual assignment.

Submitting a revision assignment

- See Step 4: Submit Coursework

If you have any problems using TurnitinUK that your tutor can't help with please contact philosophy@abdn.ac.uk